

bias trees

Question 9 (10 marks)

How useful would Sources *E* and *F* be for a historian studying the different goals of Clemenceau, Lloyd George and Wilson in creating the Treaty of Versailles? **10**

In your answer, consider the perspectives provided by the TWO sources and the reliability of each one.

Source ^E is an extract from a letter published by a member of the US delegation during the time in which the three leaders were creating the Treaty of Versailles. Therefore it is a primary source and the information is thereby ~~not~~ from someone who experienced the creation of the Treaty.

Source *E* would be highly useful for an historian studying the different goals of Clemenceau, Lloyd George and Wilson. The degree of accuracy may however be limited, as it is written from an American perspective and can therefore contain elements of bias. However the source would be highly useful for an historian as it contains an overall acute view of the three leaders' views. The source also exclusively ~~states~~ states the motives of all three leaders, which would be highly useful for an historian studying the different goals. Overall Source *E* would be highly useful as it provides a clear and concise analysis of the differing goals of all three leaders. The source is written

Question 9 continues on page 6

Question 9 (continued)

from someone who experienced the establishment of the Treaty and therefore has a strong background of knowledge, enabling a historian to use accurate historical evidence.

Source F is an extract of ~~the~~ ~~of~~ ~~the~~ ~~highlights~~ of information, written by Lloyd George (written from 1916-1922, although published in 1938). The source is therefore a primary source, as it is an extract of from what was written at the time of when the ~~creation~~ Treaty was created. The source however may contain elements of bias, as it is written strictly from Lloyd George's perspective, reflecting his personal views and interpretation.

Source F would be highly useful however for a historian studying the different goals of these leaders. The source directly reveals the motives and thoughts of Lloyd George.

This is evident in the line, "the two issues which created the greatest trouble between France, on the one hand and Britain and the US on the other, were the fixation of the western boundaries of Germany." This highly thorough analysis and insight would be extremely pertinent to a historian analysing the various leaders' motives in creating the Treaty. However ~~the~~ ~~the~~ ~~text~~ ~~could~~ ~~be~~ ~~contrived~~, depending on Lloyd George's motive and audience. In establishing this source, George may have ~~had~~ ~~the~~ ~~intention~~ ~~to~~ ~~conceal~~ ~~his~~ ~~and~~ ~~not~~ ~~revealed~~ his true intentions, due to his audience.

Additionally his ^{intention} motive may not have been to ~~show~~ ~~reveal~~ ~~everything~~, ~~and~~ ~~to~~ ~~provide~~ ~~limited~~ ~~information~~. This may be due to many factors, such as his motive and audience. However, overall

the source would be highly useful for a historian as it provides a clear insight from one of the readers who created the Treaty. It not only shows his intention, but reveals the other readers' intentions, making it a useful ~~source~~ source of historical information.

End of Question 9